

Confidential



STUDENT EVALUATION CASE COMPETITION
CONCOURS DE CAS EN ÉVALUATION POUR LES ÉTUDIANT(E)S

2023 Competition Final Round

Canada Greener Homes Initiative
Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation
and

Natural Resources Canada

June 19, 2023

The Request for Proposals in this document was developed for the Student Evaluation Case Competition for educational purposes. It does not entail any commitment on the part of the Canadian Evaluation Society (CES), the Canadian Evaluation Society Educational Fund (CESEF), the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC), Natural Resources Canada (NRCan), or any related sponsor or service delivery partner.

We thank the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and Natural Resources Canada for graciously agreeing to let us use the proposed Canada Greener Homes Initiative for the final round of the 2023 competition. We also thank Brian Diener, Alicia Suen, and Stephanie Kalt for their input in preparing this case.

The Case Competition is proudly sponsored by:



Confidential

Introduction

Congratulations to all three teams for qualifying for the Final Round of the 2023 CES/CESEF Student Evaluation Case Competition!

Your consulting firm has been invited to respond to the attached Request for Proposals (RFP) issued by the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC) and Natural Resources Canada (NRCan) to assess the relevance and performance of Canada's Greener Homes Initiative. The evaluation should offer recommendations on how the Canada Greener Homes Initiative can contribute to Canada's commitments to climate change action.

The CMHC and NRCan, supported by an advisory group of external evaluation experts, has requested a briefing from each firm on their proposal.

Your proposal should demonstrate your understanding of the assignment and include a program logic model, an evaluation matrix, a proposed methodology, a description of equity, diversity, and inclusion considerations, a mitigation strategy to address anticipated challenges, a discussion of an evaluation competency¹ that is important for a successful evaluation of this initiative, and a work plan.

Section 2.2 of the RFP identifies the proposal requirements in more detail. The assessment criteria for the proposals are identified in section 2.3. The team with the highest score will be declared the winner of the 2023 Student Evaluation Case Competition.

We look forward to your submission at the end of the day.

Organizing Committee

The members of the 2023 CES Student Case Competition Working Group and Case Selection Sub-Committee are Kathryn Radford, Brian McGowan, Christine Sheppard, Micheal Heimlick, Tin Vo, Michelle Naimi, Samantha Inwood, Janine Badr, and Dominique Leonard.

¹ Detailed descriptions of the [Competencies for Canadian Evaluators](#) is posted on the CES website under Designations.

Confidential

Rules

1. Coaches must not communicate with their teams once the case document has been distributed.
2. Teams may use the internet to search outside resources but may not consult with any individuals or organizations.
3. Teams will work together to develop their proposal presentations. Teams have 5 hours to complete their proposals.
4. A member of the organizing committee will enter the teams' rooms to take a photo of each team working.
5. At the end of 5 hours a member of the organizing committee will retrieve a USB key from your team with your submission. Your USB key will be returned.
6. Presentations should be no longer than 20 minutes. A timekeeper will give warnings as the end of the presentation period approaches. You will be cut off at the end of 20 minutes.
7. The judges will have approximately 10 minutes after the presentation to ask questions of the team. Representatives of the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and Natural Resources Canada will also be invited to ask questions. If there is time, a question from the sponsors and/or audience members may be asked.
8. Teams may present in either or both official languages. Judges will ask questions in the team's language(s) of choice.
9. A member of the organizing committee will print copies of the presentations for the judges. Teams are not permitted to provide any other materials to the judges.

Questions or Problems

To communicate with organizers on the day of the competition, please call one of the following individuals:

Name	Phone Number
Michelle Naimi	1-778-881-7855
Tin Vo	1-905-341-0413

Have fun and good luck!

Confidential

Request for Proposals

Canada Greener Homes Initiative

1.0 Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, Natural Resources Canada, and Program Profile

1.1 *About the Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation and Natural Resources Canada*

The Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation (CMHC) is a federal crown corporation that acts as Canada's national housing agency. Its mandate is to enhance Canada's housing finance options, assist Canadians who cannot afford housing in the private market, improve building standards and housing construction, and provide policymakers with information and analysis.

Natural Resources Canada (NRCan) is a federal department with a mandate committed to improving the quality of life of Canadians by ensuring the country's abundant natural resources (including energy) are developed sustainably, competitively, and inclusively.

1.2 *About the Canada Greener Homes Initiative*

Canada's [2030 Emissions Reduction Plan](#): *Canada's Next Steps for Clean Air and a Strong Economy* outlines a comprehensive strategy for reducing Canada's greenhouse gases in order to achieve the country's emissions reduction target of 40% below 2005 levels by 2030 and net-zero emissions by 2050.

According to the Government of Canada's [Green Building Strategy](#) (in progress), Canada's built environment (residential, commercial – homes, offices, etc.) accounts for 13% of national greenhouse gas emissions via building operations. This share rises to 18% when including the electricity used to power the built environment.

Studies indicate that retrofitting existing homes – such as improving the building envelope of a home by adding insulation or replacing windows and doors – is one of the most effective ways to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and save homeowners money on energy costs. Investments in retrofits to improve energy efficiency have also been shown to provide direct local benefits by creating local jobs. Energy efficiency measures can significantly reduce energy costs for Canadians, returning an initial investment in capital over time and lowering costs for the lifetime of the home.

Confidential

Canada's Greener Homes Initiative includes two main programs² for homeowners:

1. **NRCan's Greener Homes Grant (CGHG) Program.** The November 2020 Fall Economic Statement allocated \$2.6 billion over 7 years to provide grants to help homeowners make energy-efficient improvements to their homes, free EnerGuide energy assessments, and funding to recruit and train EnerGuide energy auditors to meet increased demand. Free EnerGuide home energy assessments will provide credible and easy to understand information about a home's energy use to homeowners, paired with recommendations for energy efficiency retrofits that maximize energy and greenhouse gas savings for the homeowner. The [CGHG](#) will then help lower capital costs for eligible recommended retrofit measures with up to \$5,000 per home in grants. These efforts are collectively expected to help address barriers to retrofitting existing homes.
2. **CMHC's Canada Greener Homes Loan (CGHL) Program.** Budget 2021 announced \$4.4 billion to create the [CGHL program](#) to make existing housing more energy efficient. The CGHL program offers homeowners an unsecured personal loan on approved credit of \$5,000 to \$40,000 to be repaid over a 10-year period, interest-free.

The two programs are run separately by CMHC and NRCan but are linked. Homeowners can apply for the NRCan grant and CMHC loan through an [integrated portal online](#). NRCan hosts this site, and CMHC relies on NRCan web and application portal metrics for marketing activities. Applicants must be approved for the grant before applying to the loan. This means that CMHC loan beneficiaries also receive the NRCan grant, but not all NRCan grant beneficiaries choose to apply for the CMHC loan. Thus, communication and clarity in processes across the CMHC and NRCan is vital.

Primary outcomes:

- **Immediate outcomes:** capacity is available to meet demand for EnerGuide assessments; homeowners complete EnerGuide home energy assessments.
- **Intermediate outcomes:** homes are retrofitted.
- **Ultimate outcomes:** improved energy efficiency and reduced greenhouse gas emissions in Canada's homes; households save money on energy bills.
- **Other (indirect) outcomes:** increased demand for labour in the repair construction sector.

*There are targets set for the program by the CMHC and NRCan for the number of EnerGuide energy auditors trained, number of energy audits completed, number of

² NRCan's Oil to Heat Pump Affordability Program, was announced in Budget 2023 but is excluded from the scope of the evaluation as it was only recently launched. CMHC's Canada Greener Affordable Housing is also excluded from the scope of the evaluation.

Confidential

loans dispersed, number of units with retrofits, expected greenhouse gas reductions, and average annual savings on energy bills. See Appendix A for these and other data collected by CMHC and NRCan. These may be considered as indicators for the evaluation.

Other Information about Canada Greener Homes Initiative:

- The Canada Greener Homes Grant is designed to work in collaboration with provincial programs, where available. Application procedures for the CGHG depend on the province or territory in which you reside.
- EnerGuide energy auditors (EA) are subject to registration by NRCan but are employed by external third parties (i.e., are not employees of either NRCan or CMHC). To become a registered EA, a candidate must pass two qualification exams and be affiliated with an NRCan-licensed service organization. Their role is to deliver EnerGuide rating services for eligible homes. For the Initiative, EAs conduct:
 - o Pre-retrofit EnerGuide home evaluation (reviewing the energy efficiency of the home and recommending retrofits for greater efficiency)
 - o Post-retrofit EnerGuide home evaluation (showing how much energy has been saved and greenhouse gas emissions reduced from the retrofit)
- Aside from homeowners, Indigenous governments, organizations, housing management bodies are also eligible to apply under the Canada Greener Homes Grant and the Canada Greener Homes Loan.

2.0 Scope of Work

2.1 Evaluation Services Required

The objective of this evaluation is to assess the relevance and performance of [Canada's Greener Homes Initiative](#), including CMHC's Canada Greener Homes Loan (CGHL) Program and NRCan's Greener Homes Grant (CGHG) Program.

This will be the first evaluation of these programs and will identify lessons learned in the first three years of implementation to make recommendations.

CMHC and NRCan are seeking a consulting team to conduct an evaluation of the Canada Greener Homes Initiative to assess:

- The extent to which funded activities have been fully implemented
- What has worked, and/or what is preventing effective implementation
- The extent to which eligible households are accessing the programs, including barriers to access
- If the programs guide households towards energy bill savings
- How the programs contribute to improved energy efficiency in Canada's homes
- The overall projected impact on greenhouse gas reduction

Confidential

2.2 *Proposal Requirements*

The Advisory Committee expects proposals to include the following components:

1. An overview of your understanding of the Canada Greener Homes Initiative and the evaluation requirements.
2. A proposed logic model or alternative description/model of program flow and logic model narrative for the program, including at least one underlying assumption, one risk and one external factor that may influence whether the outcomes can be achieved. These can be part of the logic model figure or explained as part of the logic model narrative.
3. An evaluation matrix for the Canada Greener Homes Initiative, with a list of key evaluation questions, one to three indicators per question, and clearly indicating which indicator is linked to which question. A list of administrative data collected by the CMHC and NRCan is provided in **Appendix A**. Both quantitative and qualitative measures are sought.
4. A description of how you would undertake the evaluation (approach and methodology) with emphasis on how the indicators will be collected. The approach should consider environmental, financial, economic, and social benefits, as well as effects at the household, environment, and national level. Teams are encouraged to consult Canada's [2030 Emissions Reduction Plan](#) and [Green Building Strategy](#) to identify how the Canada Greener Homes Initiative can contribute to Canada's commitments to climate change action.
5. A description of equity, diversity, and inclusion (EDI) considerations. Please use an EDI lens to examine the CGH Initiative, including the evaluation questions, the program structure and delivery model, as well as stakeholder engagement (e.g., homeowners with diverse identities and socioeconomic status, program staff from CMHC and NRCan, and energy auditors).
6. Teams are also asked to identify anticipated challenges (e.g., methodological, communication, data sharing, partnership) with this initiative being implemented via two separate programs and two entities (i.e., CMHC and NRCan) and how you propose to deal with them.
7. Select two of the Credentialed Evaluator competencies³ that you feel is most important for a successful evaluation of this initiative in managing relationships with a crown corporation and federal government, and discuss why this competency is most important and how it is reflected in the evaluation plan.

³ [Competencies for Canadian Evaluators](#) is posted on the CES website under Designations.

Confidential

8. A work plan (table) that outlines the different activities and the associated timelines for completion.

Teams are not expected to present a budget for this assignment; however, to help you in understanding the anticipated scope of the work, the project will take an estimated 150 consultant days over the span of 1 year.

2.3 Judging Criteria

The criteria by which submissions will be assessed are as follows:

- 1) Quality, innovation, and thoroughness in addressing the requirements that are outlined in Section 2.0 of the RFP in the team's proposal presentation. (50%)
- 2) Quality of the in-person presentation in terms of clarity, flow of information, persuasiveness, and interaction with the judges. Team members' involvement and collaboration in the presentation and subsequent question and answer session. (50%)

Confidential

Appendix A: Administrative Data Collected by CMHC and NRCan

Dimension	Indicators
About the dwelling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Geographic data on location of applicant(s) (e.g., Address, CSD, CMA, Province, Federal Riding) • Age of dwelling • Type of house
About the applicant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Age of applicant(s) • Gender identity of applicant(s) • Indigenous Identity of applicant(s) • Racial identity of applicant(s) • Birthdate of applicant(s) • Total Debt Service (TDS) Ratio • Total Income of loan applicant(s)
About the work undertaken	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Average housing shelter cost reduction (i.e., reduction in costs related to the home beyond rent or mortgage, this can also mean utilities, etc.) • Change in Energuide rating • Cost per rating point • Projected greenhouse gas (GHG) reduction • Petajoule (PJ) savings from EnerGuide evaluation • Time taken to complete work • Energuide rating prior to work undertaken • Energuide rating after work completed • Estimated average annual money saved per year on energy bills by participating households • Date and Time application decision delivered by Portal - Date and Time • Date and Time applications received by portal • Date work began • Date work finished • Cost of Retrofits completed • Cost of Retrofits planned • Types of retrofits completed • Types of retrofits planned
About the Grant	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of applications • Value of grant requested (total and per applicant) • Value of grant dispersed (total and per applicant) • Number of funded retrofits

Confidential

Dimension	Indicators
About the Loan	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Loan-To-Value (LTV) at approval• LTV at disbursement• Total amount of loan disbursed• Amount of loan repaid to date• Approved loan amount• Final loan disbursed• Up-front loan disbursement• Number of funded retrofits
Program awareness	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Number of visits to the program website
Energy advisors	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Number of Energy Advisors trained• Number of Energy Advisors registered• Number of NRCan-licensed service organizations