

Department ABC Telework Evaluation Plan



Prepared By Focus Five Consultants

University of Ottawa

June 2, 2003



Outline

- Introduce ABC Telework pilot
- Overview of proposed evaluation
- Provide feedback and suggestions
- Summarize and Focus Five deliverables



Introduction

- The proposed evaluation will examine these areas:
 - Design and implementation of the program
 - Satisfaction and perceptions of the program
 - Productivity and short-term outcomes of the program
- This preliminary evaluation proposal will be refined according to stakeholder feedback
 - Teleworkers, supervisors and non-telework staff will be asked to participate



Introduction

- The telework program is being implemented as a response to employee concerns regarding balancing family and work life
- We are proposing a two-component evaluation:
 - An implementation evaluation: Is the telework program being implemented as planned?
 - A short-term outcome evaluation: Is the telework program producing the results envisioned?



Focus Five
Consultants

Proposal Review

- Current plan seen as both process and outcome-based evaluation
- Incongruence between intended evaluation plan and Preliminary Performance Indicators
- Ambiguity of input/output/outcome items in current framework



Suggested Changes

- Establish clear logic model for program *as intended*
- Delineate framework into two distinct sections/phases:
 - Implementation
 - Outcome
- Add appropriate items to supplement and complete both sections
- Clarify indicators for evaluation



Program Logic Model

Program Logic Model for Department ABC Telework Program

Mission: To help employees achieve a better balance between their personal and professional lives and to help the department create a more flexible and productive work environment, increased service and reduced operating costs

Needs	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Immediate Outcomes	Intermediate Outcomes	Final Outcomes
<p>Employees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -balanced work/family life -increased morale -increased job satisfaction -reduced commuting time -accommodation of health problems or disabilities <p>Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -increased employee productivity -increased morale -increased job satisfaction -increased staff retention and recruitment 	<p>Planned resources include:</p> <p>-Employees (FT/PT)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -costs of premises, utilities (phone, hydro etc.) <p>-Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Departmental-level co-operation from: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Administration -HR -Finance -Information systems -Equipment (computer, fax, printer etc.) -Telework Self-Assessment guide, Tips for setting up home office 	<p>Employee activities include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -reading proposals -conducting research -administrative tasks -attend telework orientation sessions -regular reporting with management <p>Management activities include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -facilitate telework orientation sessions -installation, maintenance of equipment -provide advice and support to teleworkers -ABC departmental meetings -communicate telework policy -performance evaluation 	<p>Employees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -# attending orientation sessions -# proposals read -# research projects -# hours spent on administrative tasks -# phone calls, emails <p>Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -# attending sessions -# hours spent on telework support -# orientation sessions held -# applications approved, rejected -# telework stations installed -frequency of maintenance -# telework memos circulated -# evaluations completed 	<p>Employees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -maintain or ↑ quality and quantity of work -↑ awareness, knowledge of telework program and policy for new teleworkers <p>Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -maintenance or ↑ of supervisory activities 	<p>Employees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↑ satisfaction with telework -↑ awareness, knowledge of telework impact, benefits - ↑ motivation to apply policy -↑ work/life balance <p>Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↑ motivation to participate in telework -↑ comfort with teleworking 	<p>Employees</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↓ absenteeism -↑ awareness, knowledge of telework program and policy for new teleworkers -↓ in grievances from employees -↑ morale <p>Management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -↑ recruitment of employees -↓ operating costs -↓ employee turnover



Methodology

- Three surveys will be used
 - Telework staff: Satisfaction and suitability for telework
 - Supervisors: Satisfaction
 - Non-telework staff: Satisfaction
 - Surveys will take no more than 15 minutes to complete
- Interviews will be conducted with staff and management
- Internal ABC documentation will be reviewed



New Framework - Implementation

Question	Indicator	Source
Cost of hardware?	\$ of new hardware	Admin records
Cost of maintenance?	\$ of maintenance	Admin records
Cost to employees?	\$ of utilities etc..	Expense records
Is there sufficient hardware?	# of computers, hardware	Management and employee survey
Are telework screening rules implemented?	# accepted, rejected, employee characteristics	Management and employee survey
Are guidelines followed for implementation of pilot?	Congruence of guidelines and practices, # orientation sessions	Management and employee survey
Are work activities carried out as expected?	#of proposals, research projects...	Employee survey, supervisor reports
Is information disseminated to ABC, employees?	# of memos, internal communication, increased knowledge of telework	Admin records, management survey, employee survey



New Framework – Immediate Outcomes

Question	Indicator	Source
Are other staff able to pursue their own work with minimal disruption ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported co-worker burden caused by telework	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Staff survey
Is quality and quantity of work produced by teleworkers is at least equal to what it was in the official workplace ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Opinion of supervisors of quantity and quality of work performed by teleworker	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with telemanagers
Is job satisfaction increased for teleworkers ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported job satisfaction level, feeling of inclusion... (pre and post)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with pilot participants• SCL-90• MSQ
Is work-life balance improved for teleworkers ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported feeling of isolation of teleworkers (pre and post)• Self-reported stress level of teleworkers (pre and post)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with pilot participants• Review of overtime forms and structured interviews with pilot participants to confirm



New framework – Intermediate outcomes

Question	Indicator	Source
Is job satisfaction increased for teleworkers ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported job satisfaction level (pre and post)• Self-reported feeling of inclusion in office life (pre and post)• Self-reported feeling of being penalized because of telework (pre and post)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with pilot participants• SCL-90• MSQ
Is work-life balance improved for teleworkers ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported feeling of isolation of teleworkers (pre and post)• Self-reported stress level of teleworkers (pre and post)• Estimated paid and unpaid overtime per week (pre and post)• Estimated personal costs to teleworker (pre and post)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with pilot participants• Review of overtime forms and structured interviews with pilot participants to confirm



New framework – Intermediate outcomes

Question	Indicator	Source
Is teleworker productivity increased ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Self-reported feeling of isolation of teleworkers (pre and post)• Self-reported stress level of teleworkers (pre and post)• Estimated paid and unpaid overtime per week (pre and post)• Estimated personal costs to teleworker (pre and post)	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Structured interviews with pilot participants• Review of overtime forms and structured interviews with pilot participants
Are managers comfortable with teleworking ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Absenteeism rates of teleworkers (pre and post)• Productivity rates of teleworkers	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Review of monthly leave forms• Structured interviews with telemanagers
Is interest among staff increased towards participating in telework ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Awareness of telework program• Number of applications for telework	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Staff survey• Review of application forms



New framework – Intermediate outcomes

Question	Indicator	Source
What is the cost/benefit of telework program ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Cost of absenteeism (pre and post)• Cost of material maintenance (pre and post)• Cost of additional meetings and administrative activities specifically related to teleworking	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Review of administrative expenses records
Is information disseminated to the Department ABC about the telework policy useful to staff ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Number of applications• Level of awareness• Satisfaction rates of staff regarding the information provided about telework policy	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Review of application forms• Staff survey



New framework – Final outcomes (5-year)

Question	Indicator	Source
Are Department ABC's operating costs reduced ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Reduction of operating costs due to telework	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Cost-benefit analysis with a review of administrative expenses records
Is morale increased among Department ABC ?	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Comparison of staff morale pre and post implementation	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Staff survey



Focus Five
Consultants

Teleworker Survey: Satisfaction

- Feeling of inclusion/ isolation
- Fairness of supervision
- Stress level
- Impact of telework on family life

Sample question:

I feel like I'm part of the team

1	2	3	4	5
Not at all	A little bit	Somewhat	Mostly	Very much



Focus Five
Consultants

Teleworker Survey: Suitability

➤ Fit between home and demands of job

Sample question:

My home office is isolated from distractions

1	2	3	4	5
Not at all	A little bit	Somewhat	Mostly	Very much



Focus Five
Consultants

Supervisor Survey

- Impediments to management
- Impact on working relationships
- Disruption to office routine
- Perceived benefits of program

Sample Question

The telework program benefits the department

1

2

3

4

5

Not at all

A little bit

Somewhat

Mostly

Very much



Non-teleworker Survey

- Availability of teleworkers
- Fairness of treatment by supervisors
- Benefits and limitations of program

Sample Question

Telework colleagues are available during working hours

1

Not at all

2

A little bit

3

Somewhat

4

Mostly

5

Very much



Teleworker Interview Protocol

➤ Reasons for teleworking and ending telework

Sample question: What are some of the specific reasons for your decision to telework?

➤ Impact on home/ family life

➤ e.g. child care, commuting time, personal costs

Sample question: How has telework affected your ability to care for your children?

➤ Social impact

➤ e.g. feelings of isolation, exclusion from work culture

Sample question: Has telework affected your collegial relationships?



Teleworker Interview Protocol

➤ Career impact

- e.g. promotion, salary increase

Sample question: Has telework limited your career advancement?

➤ Perceived productivity and expectations

Sample question: How have your expectations of your own performance been affected by telework?

➤ Suggestions for improvement of telework program

Sample question: How can the telework program be improved?



Supervisor Interview Protocol

- Reasons for approving, denying or ending telework
- Sample question: How do you justify a decision to allow an employee to telework?

- Impact on management

Sample question: How has telework affected your ability to effectively manage your team?

- Incentive to telework

Sample question: Would you telework if given the opportunity?

- Suggestions for improvement of telework program

Sample question: How can the telework program be improved?



Data Analysis: Implementation

- Descriptive analyses:
 - Number of telework stations installed
 - Number of applications accepted and rejected
 - Costs: e.g. start-up, equipment, maintenance
 - Training and dissemination of information: attendance at meetings, e-mails and memos sent, orientation sessions, etc.



Data Analysis: Outcome

- Quantitative data
 - ANOVAs to compare pre-program, six-months, and one-year (post-implementation) on:
 - Satisfaction (Survey, MSQ)
 - SCL-90
 - Productivity (e.g. performance reviews, absenteeism)
 - Between groups: ANOVA to compare teleworkers, supervisors and non-teleworkers' levels of satisfaction
- Qualitative data
 - Will examine common themes expressed in interviews by teleworkers, supervisors and non-teleworkers



Staff and Management Buy-In

- Stress that this is only a *pilot project*
 - Evaluation of actual performance will indicate the degree of success of the telework program
 - Continuation of the program will be contingent upon results of the pilot project
 - Interim results will be examined at regular intervals



Staff and Management Buy-In

- Participatory evaluation methods
 - Will increase staff and managers' feeling of investment in the program and the evaluation process
 - Management concerns to be directly addressed in the evaluation (e.g. frequent performance evaluations of teleworkers)
 - Fact sheets: Information and results of the evaluation to be disseminated at regular intervals



Rationale For Changes

- Proposed changes reflect emphasis on:
 - Subjective and Objective measures
 - Qualitative and Quantitative analyses
- Suitability of assessment methodologies reviewed to provide enriched picture
- Detailed timeline for evaluation provides better roadmap



Focus Five
Consultants

Projected Timeline

Component	Source	July 2003	Jan 2004	Mar 2004	July 2004	July 2008
Proposal, framework, instruments		★				
Data collection	Employee survey, interviews	★	★		★	★
	Managerial survey, interviews	★	★		★	★
	Admin Records	★			★	★
	Satisfaction Survey, MSQ	★			★	★
	Well-being, SCL-90	★			★	★
Mid-Term Report to committee				★		
Final Report to committee					★	★



Conclusion


- Telework is a potential solution to many work-related stressors
 - It is essential that telework programs are carefully implemented and assessed
 - This evaluation will allow for assessment of functioning in work, social and family life



Conclusion

- Implementation and short-term outcome evaluation of a pilot program:
 - Allows us to discern where changes need to be made
 - Program design
 - Program implementation
 - Can serve as a baseline for decision-making for both managers and workers in the future
 - Can be used as a framework for future evaluations
 - Long-term outcomes should be evaluated at a future date


Thank You!




100101010000101
101001111110111
100101010000101

abc

Faculté des sciences sociales
École de psychologie
Faculty of Social Sciences
School of Psychology



depuis 1848
since 1848



Université d'Ottawa
University of Ottawa